



Funded by the
European Union

eofmd

european commission for the
control of foot-and-mouth disease

EUFAST
Foot-and-mouth disease And Similar
Transboundary animal diseases

Simulation exercises: evaluation forms

No.16

Contents

Introduction	3
Evaluation plan – collection methods and tools.....	4
Evaluation plan - observation checklist for a functional exercise	5
Example of a data collection form (1a).....	6
Example of a data collection form (1b)	7
Example of a data collection form (1c).....	8
Example of a data collection form (2)	9
Example of a data collection form (3a).....	10
Example of a data collection form (3b)	11
Example of a data collection form (4)	12
Example of a data collection form (5a).....	13
Example of a data collection form (5b)	14
Example of a data collection form (5c).....	15
Example of a data collection form (5d)	16
Event response form	17
Issues log	18
Exercise evaluation questionnaire – participant feedback form	19
References and further reading	22

Introduction

A variety of forms are necessary to plan the evaluation, capture the observations and analyse the results.

Each event differs in exercise type, methodology and objectives.

Forms should be objective, simple and specific to the exercise.

Data may be collected during the exercise (e.g. using data collection forms and issue logs) or afterwards (e.g. using self-assessment questionnaires, surveys or evaluator meetings).

Examples of forms used by different organizations are provided.

Evaluation plan – collection methods and tools

A form used to list the collection methods and forms to be used during the exercise being planned.

Exercise Name:				
Location:				
Date/time:				
Evaluation Ref. No.	Activity/objective	Collection method*	Collection tool/form	Comments

**Examples of collection methods include: observation during activities, participant feedback questionnaire.*

Example of a data collection form (1a)

A form used by each evaluator to record their observations during the exercise and their analysis after the exercise.

Part A: Observations

Exercise name:	
Exercise location:	
Date/time:	

Objective 1:	Assess the Operations Manual procedures to identify, select and prepare personnel for deployment under the Shared Resources Arrangement	
Performance indicator 1.1:	The operations manual is accessible and supports the ability of countries to identify, select and prepare personnel for deployment	
Observations (based on Q1-7 in checklist in Part C)	Analysis (to be completed after the exercise)	

Objective 1:		
Performance indicator 1.2:		
Observations (based on checklist in Part C)	Analysis (to be completed after the exercise)	

Example of a data collection form (1c)

Part C: Checklist

Expected Actions	Manual reference	Time/date	Observations	Analysis
1. Formal request for assistance sent by National Authority of Lead Agency to donor agencies with deadline for response of 5 pm 23 Nov	Appendix 3	12 pm, 22 Nov	<input type="checkbox"/>	
2. Initial response from donor agencies received by recipient Authority		5 pm 23 Nov	<input type="checkbox"/>	
3. Recipient Authority considers donor agency responses and invokes the Shared Resources Arrangement. Donor agencies notified of Recipient Deployment Coordinator (RDC) and requests nomination of Donor Deployment Coordinator (DDC) (Deadline 10 am 25 Nov)	Appendices 4 and 5, and Section 7.1	5 pm, 24 Nov	<input type="checkbox"/>	
4. Donor agencies nominate a DDC and advise recipient Authority	Section 7.1	10 am, 25 Nov	<input type="checkbox"/>	
5. Donor agencies request volunteers and screen personnel for the roles requested.	Section 7.2	Ongoing from 24 Nov	<input type="checkbox"/>	
6. RDC requests DDC nominations and details of personnel (Deadline 5 pm 28 Nov)	Appendix 6		<input type="checkbox"/>	
7. RDC receives nominations and details of personnel from donor agencies		5 pm, 28 Nov	<input type="checkbox"/>	

Example of a data collection form (2)

A form used by each evaluator to record their observations during the exercise.

Exercise name	
Date	
Function/task being exercised	

N.B. Tick relevant box on right (Y= Yes P= Partially N= No)

Ref	Observations	Rating		
1	Is there a written procedure for this task? <i>Comment:</i>	Y	P	N
2	Was the procedure followed? <i>Comment:</i>	Y	P	N
3	Did the actual outcomes match the expected outcomes? Please relate to specific outcomes. <i>Comment:</i>	Y	P	N
	General comments:			
Evaluator name:				
Contact number:				

Example of a data collection form (3a)

A form used by each evaluator to record their observations during the exercise.

Exercise name:						
Exercise location:						
Date/time:						
Evaluation Ref No.	Observations	Rating				
1	Donning (putting on) of personal protective equipment Comment:	P	S	M	U	N
2	Clinical examination Comment:	P	S	M	U	N
3	Ageing of lesions Comment:	P	S	M	U	N
4	Sampling Comment:	P	S	M	U	N
5	Epidemiological enquiry Comment:	P	S	M	U	N
6	Doffing (removing) of personal protective equipment Comment:	P	S	M	U	N
Evaluator name						
Contact number						

Key: *Performed without Challenge (P)*
 Performed with Some Challenges (S)
 Performed with Major Challenges (M)
 Unable to be Performed (U)
 Not observed (N)

Example of a data collection form (3b)

Ratings definitions	
Performed without challenges (P)	<p>The targets and critical tasks associated with the core function were completed in a manner that achieved the objective(s) and did not negatively impact the performance of other activities.</p> <p>Performance of this activity did not contribute to risks to health and/or safety risks for the public or for responders, and did not impact on biosecurity.</p> <p>The activity was conducted in accordance with applicable plans, policies, procedures, regulations, and laws.</p>
Performed with some challenges (S)	<p>The targets and critical tasks associated with the core function were completed in a manner that achieved the objective(s) and did not negatively impact the performance of other activities.</p> <p>Performance of this activity did not contribute to health and/or safety risks for the public or for responders, and did not impact on biosecurity.</p> <p>The activity was conducted in accordance with applicable plans, policies, procedures, regulations, and laws.</p> <p>However, opportunities to enhance effectiveness and/or efficiency were identified.</p>
Performed with major challenges (M)	<p>The targets and critical tasks associated with the core function were completed in a manner that achieved the objective(s), but some or all of the following were observed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • demonstrated performance had a negative impact on the performance of other activities; • contributed to additional health and/or safety risks for the public or for responders, or to biosecurity risks; and/or • was not conducted in accordance with applicable plans, policies, procedures, regulations, and laws.
Unable to be performed (U)	<p>The targets and critical tasks associated with the core function were not performed in a manner that achieved the objective(s).</p>

Example of a data collection form (4)

A form used by each evaluator to record their observations during the exercise.

Exercise name:				
Exercise location:				
Date/time:				
Evaluation Ref No.	Evaluation code*	Inject No.	Evaluation question	Comments
Theme - Communications				
2	C1	113	Were statements/briefing prepared in time to meet national communication needs?	
Evidence				
3	C2	116	Were messages coordinated on human health/animal health/food safety?	
Evidence				
Theme - Legislation				
4	L1	203	Was the legal basis for policy decisions clear?	
Evidence				
5	L2	210	Were the international reporting requirements to OIE met?	
Evidence				
Evaluator name				
Contact number				

*Evaluation Code e.g. C=communications, L=legislation. May also include a code for strategic, tactical or operational level.

Example of a data collection form (5a)

This form uses the Observation-Analysis-Judgement-Recommendation (OAJR) methodology. The form is used by each evaluator to record their observations during the exercise and their analysis after the exercise.

Part A: Evaluation checklist

Exercise name:											
Exercise location:											
Date/time:											
1. Evaluation question:	Rating:										
Comment:	<table style="width: 100%; text-align: center;"> <tr> <td>--</td> <td>-</td> <td>+/-</td> <td>+</td> <td>++</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> </table> <input type="checkbox"/> Not applicable	--	-	+/-	+	++	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
--	-	+/-	+	++							
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>							
2. Evaluation question:	Rating:										
Comment:	<table style="width: 100%; text-align: center;"> <tr> <td>--</td> <td>-</td> <td>+/-</td> <td>+</td> <td>++</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> </table> <input type="checkbox"/> Not applicable	--	-	+/-	+	++	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
--	-	+/-	+	++							
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>							
3. Evaluation question:	Rating:										
Comment:	<table style="width: 100%; text-align: center;"> <tr> <td>--</td> <td>-</td> <td>+/-</td> <td>+</td> <td>++</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> </table> <input type="checkbox"/> Not applicable	--	-	+/-	+	++	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
--	-	+/-	+	++							
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>							
4. Evaluation question:	Rating:										
Comment:	<table style="width: 100%; text-align: center;"> <tr> <td>--</td> <td>-</td> <td>+/-</td> <td>+</td> <td>++</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> </table> <input type="checkbox"/> Not applicable	--	-	+/-	+	++	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
--	-	+/-	+	++							
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>							
Evaluator name:											
Contact number:											

Example of a data collection form (5b)

Part B: Evaluation log

Exercise name:				
Exercise location:				
Exercise date:				
Key observation theme	Observation (I saw/heard)	Analysis (Due to this/as a consequence)	Judgement (In my opinion)	Recommendation (In future I suggest)
e.g. coordination	Response team leaders were not easily identifiable to other personnel working on the site.	Time was lost in trying to find the relevant team leaders on the site.	Team leaders should be easily identifiable.	Team leaders could be provided with different colour clothing or a tabard with their role printed on it.
Evaluator name:				
Contact number:				

Example of a data collection form (5c)

Part C: Final narrative summary

Exercise name:	
Exercise location:	
Date/time:	
Observation: (I saw/heard)	
Analysis: (Due to this/as a consequence)	
Judgement: (In my opinion)	
Recommendation: (In future I suggest)	
Evaluator name:	
Contact number:	

Event response form

A form used by each control team member to record their observations during the exercise.

Exercise name							
Exercise location							
Exercise date							
Inject no. from MEL	Time received	Received by	Responded by	Objective/ Theme*	Action		Comments on action taken
					Expected (tick)	Not expected (tick)	
Participant name							
Signature							
Role							
Contact number							

*Theme e.g. communications, legislation, policy, finance, information management.

Issues log

A form used by participants to record issues in relation to the organization of the exercise (planning, conduct or evaluation).

Exercise name			
Exercise location			
Exercise date			
Role		Player/Controller/Facilitator/Evaluator/Observer	
Time	Inject number	Issue	Analysis (to be completed after the exercise)
Participant name			
Signature			
Contact number			

Exercise evaluation questionnaire – participant feedback form

A self-assessment questionnaire used by participants to give feedback after the exercise.

Exercise name	
Exercise date	
Participant name*	
Participant title*	
Agency*	
Role	Player/Controller/Facilitator/Evaluator/Observer

**May not be required*

PART A: Feedback on the design and conduct of the exercise

Statement (examples)	Assessment				
	Strongly disagree	Somewhat disagree	Neither agree or disagree	Somewhat agree	Strongly agree
1. I received adequate information to assist me in preparing for and participating in the exercise.	1	2	3	4	5
2. The exercise resources and logistics were appropriate for this exercise.	1	2	3	4	5
3. I understood my role in the exercise.	1	2	3	4	5
4. The exercise control ran smoothly in a coordinated and structured manner.	1	2	3	4	5
5. The exercise scenario was plausible and realistic.	1	2	3	4	5
6. The control team were knowledgeable about the area of play and kept the exercise on target.	1	2	3	4	5
7. Participation in the exercise was appropriate for someone in my position.	1	2	3	4	5
8. The exercise provided an opportunity for the players to <activity>.	1	2	3	4	5
9. Players were appropriately and fully engaged during the day.	1	2	3	4	5
10. After this exercise, I believe my agency is better prepared to deal successfully with the scenario that was exercised.	1	2	3	4	5

Please share any recommendations you have to improve similar exercises in the future.

Recommendations for improvement in the design and conduct of the exercise

PART B: Strengths and areas for improvement

Based on the exercise, what are the main (*or top three) strengths and areas for improvement (e.g. in policies, plans, procedures, equipment, training)?

Strengths and areas for improvement
Strengths
Areas for improvement

**Can be limited to three (e.g. when the number of participants is very large)*

ALTERNATIVE PART B: Recommendations and corrective actions

1. Based on the exercise today and the tasks identified, list the main (or top three) areas that need improvement.
2. Identify the corrective actions that should be taken to address the issues identified in 1 above. For each corrective action, indicate if it is a high, medium, or low priority.
3. Describe the corrective actions <u>that relate to your area of responsibility</u>. Who should be assigned responsibility for each corrective action?
4. List the relevant equipment, training, policies, plans, and procedures that should be reviewed, revised, or developed. Indicate the priority level for each.

References and further reading

1. Australian Department of Agriculture and Water Resources (2017) [Biosecurity emergency management: Evaluation and lessons management guide](#)
2. Federal Emergency Management Agency (2020) [Evaluation templates](#)
3. Irish Government Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (2016) [A Framework for Major Emergency Management Guidance Document 4: A Guide to Planning and Staging Exercises](#)
4. Netherlands Institute for Physical Safety (2009) [EU FloodEx field exercise evaluation report](#)
5. Swedish Civil Contingencies Agency (2011) [Handbook on evaluation of exercises](#)
6. Swedish Civil Contingencies Agency (2017) [Exercise guidance method booklet – Exercise evaluation](#)
7. United Kingdom Animal and Plant Health Agency templates (personal communication)
8. World Health Organization (2009) [Emergency exercise development](#) Unit 8
9. World Health Organization (2017) [Simulation exercise toolbox](#)